Integrating socio-economic and environmental aspects into decision-making about DSM



#### Sybille van den Hove

SPC Pacific ACP States 5th Regional Training Workshop"Deep Sea Minerals: Financial Aspects"13th-16th May, Rarotonga, Cook Islands





### A brief introduction to MIDAS □ Socio-economic research in HERMES, and **HERMIONE** Some reflections on values, decision making, the broader picture, dilemmas and precaution

# Content





#### MANAGING IMPACTS OF DEEP SEA RESOURCE EXPLOITATION

# **Project Objectives**

- Identify scale and duration of possible impacts on deep-sea ecosystems of different types of resource extraction activities → Impacts
- Develop workable solutions and best practice codes for environmentally sound and socially acceptable mining activities → Sustainable management
- Work with policy makers in the European and international arenas to enshrine best practice in international and national regulations and overarching legal frameworks → Governance





MIDAS



# About the project

- ♦ Focus on 3 types of resources:
  - DS Minerals from sea-floor massive sulphides, Mn nodules & Co-rich Fe-Mn crusts
  - Rare earth elements
  - Gas hydrates
- Funded by the European Union's FP 7 Research Programme under theme "Sustainable management of Europe's deep sea and sub-seafloor resources" (Grant Agreement 603418)
- Project duration 3 years, starting 1 November 2013
- ♦ Budget € 12.5 million; EC contribution € 9 million
- 32 partners across 11 countries (UK, France, Germany, Portugal, Norway, Belgium, the Netherlands, Italy, Spain, Poland, Russia)
- Expertise includes marine scientists, policy & legal experts, social scientists, technologists, EIA practitionners

#### www.eu-midas.net







MEDIAN

# **Work Programme**







# **Field Programme**



## Other relevant research projects



Hotspot Ecosystems Research on the Margins of European Seas <u>www.eu-hermes.net</u>







Hotspot Ecosystems Research and Man's Impact on European Seas www.eu-herminone.net





#### A scientific drive to discover and understand the ecosystems and the human impacts, combined to a recognition of the need for policy-relevant knowledge



MEDIAN

#### Deep-sea Ecosystems

- Dimensions
- Distribution
- ✓ Interconnection
- ✓ Biological capacities
- ✓ Specific adaptations
- ✓ Functioning
- ✓ Importance of biodiversity
- ✓ Goods and services
- ✓ Values
- ✓ Governance
- ✓ Changes
- Drivers of change (climate change, human impacts, large-scale episodic events)
- ✓ Policy support
- Dissemination

## Socio-Economic and Governance Research







# Why care about deep-sea ecosystems?



#### • Usefulness arguments

- ecosystem goods and services concept, captures dependence of human well-being on natural capital and flow of services it provides.
- Ethical arguments
  - e.g. intrinsic value; rights of other species/ mother nature; duty to preserve; stewardship; belonging...

# Complementary justifications



# Because they are threatened



Human activities & impacts in the deep sea

**Fishing Oil & gas industry** Mining **Bio-prospecting** Submarine cables **Dumping of waste Dumping of offshore structures Dumping of wrecks and ammunitions** Military activities (submarines, noise) Scientific research Shipping **Carbon sequestration** Gas hydrate exploration/extraction

Pollution from land-based activities Atmospheric deposition of elements and contaminants Climate change Ocean acidification

#### Direct and Indirect impacts Combined pressures

UNEP 2007 Glover & Smith, 2003 Thiel, 2003 OSPAR QSR, 2000 Benn et al. 2010



# Because they are useful...



#### ECOSYSTEM SERVICES



Millennium Ecosystem Assessment, 2005

# Deep-sea goods and services

- Supporting services: Chemosynthetic primary production; nutrient cycling; resilience; habitat,...
- Provisioning services: Fish; oil & gas; genetic resources and chemical compounds for industrial and pharmaceutical uses; waste disposal sites,...
- Regulating services: Water circulation and exchange; Gas and climate regulation; Carbon sequestration and storage; Waste absorption and detoxification; Biological control of pests; ...
- Cultural services: Educational; Scientific; Aesthetic; Spiritual;...

Goods and services provided by deep-sea ecosystems and the key roles they play in global biogeochemical and ecological processes are essential to the sustainable functioning of our biosphere and to human wellbeing.

# It is not just monetary values



- Value is a philosophical and ethical concept, not just an economic concept.
- Values are implicit and/or explicit in everything we do.
- Values cannot and need not necessarily be express in quantitative, monetary terms.
- Values can be recognised in qualitative or quantitative terms, along various dimensions.
- → There are different types of value evidence and different potential applications of value evidence in deep-sea governance

Can we develop value articulation processes which take into account normative and ethical dimensions, and re-establish the role of intuition, common sense and ethics in environmental and social valuation?





# Uncertainties, irreversibilities



- Huge gaps in knowledge and uncertainties about:
  - deep-sea biodiversity
  - ecology of systems
  - goods and services provided;
  - relationships between biodiversity, ecosystem functions, services;
  - human activities and impacts;
  - baselines
- Uncertainties and indeterminacies inherent to complex social-ecological systems
- Knowledge is growing more slowly than anthropogenic pressure
- Yet impacts can/could be (quasi)-irreversible (e.g. trawling, some forms of deep-sea mining,...)



# Asymmetry between the 3 'pillars' of sustainability



# Irreversibilities and precaution

- It is not the same to be wrong when impacts are reversible and when they are irreversible
- Reflect on pros and cons of being wrong
- Potential irreversibility and/or high stakes call for precautionary approaches:
  - Acknowledge the possibility of surprises
  - keep your options open
  - diversify to build resilience
  - avoid lock-ins
  - Revisit
  - Adapt
  - be humble ...







# Acknowledging dilemmas, reflecting on aims

- Dilemma between (short term) profits/revenues and environmental + social risks/impacts
- Should we rush to exploit deep sea resources independently of the social and environmental risks and impacts?
- In "developed" countries, often justified by incantations to growth...
- In "developing" countries, by incantations to development... ... yet the questions "Growth: what for and how?", "Development: what for and how?" are seldom asked
- In the private sector, incantations to profit, yet often a confusion of means and ends: what should the goal of a company? Making profit or delivering a service to society with profit being a necessary means towards that end?

"Perfection of means and confusion of goals seem, in my opinion, to characterise our age" A. Einstein (1941)



MEDIAN

# Going beyond the dilemmas

- Broaden the time horizon
  - Short term thinking can lead to wrong decisions
- Broaden the interest range
  - $\Rightarrow$  broader set of values into the picture
    - Do not look only at the financial benefits
- Ask the "what for" question
- Break free of lock-ins: technological, institutional, ideological
- Learn to live with uncertainty, ignorance, imperfect (or absent) evidence, high risks and irreversibility

 $\rightarrow$  Humility, Precaution, Imagination





# Late lessons from early warnings...



1 Skewer High 2014

Late lessons from early warnings: science, precaution, innovation





European Environment Agency

# Towards more holistic governance approaches

- addressing the interconnectedness of issues
- building on concepts such as the ecosystem approach, integrated management, natural capital, ecosystem services, the precautionary principle, adaptive management, transformative capacity, ...
- allowing for progressive integration of information as it becomes available;
- and integration of different value judgement and logics;
- dynamic processes of capacity-building, aiming at innovative, flexible and adjustable answers (not all eggs in one basket, leave options open, avoid lock-ins, learn as you go).



# Take home messages

- There is on-going research in Europe on deep-sea ecosystems and managing impacts of deep-sea resource exploitation
  Jet's connect
- Decision-making on DSM should keep the broader picture in mind, including social and environmental aspects of sustainable development, alternative development paths, long-term and intergenerational issues, complexities,...
  - $\rightarrow$  let's try not to repeat the errors from the past
- There is more to value than economic (monetary) value and there are limits to cost-benefit analysis

→ let's broaden our analysis of pros and cons

Irreversibility (or quasi-irreversibility) of damages creates a fundamental asymmetry which, together with high stakes and uncertainties, calls for precautionary approaches



MEDIAN



### Meitaki And thanks to the HERMES, HERMIONE, MIDAS and EEA teams

sybille@median-web.eu







